METHODS OF FOREIGN EXPERIENCE IMPLEMENTATION FOR CIVIL SERVANTS’ PROFESSIONAL TRAINING IN UKRAINE

METHODИ ИМПЛЕМЕНТАЦІЇ ЗАРУБІЖНОГО ДОСВІДУ ПРОФЕСІЙНОЇ ПІДГОТОВКИ ДЕРЖАВНИХ СЛУЖБОВЦІВ В УКРАЇНІ

Hanna O. Hratsiotova, PhD in Economics
Odessa Polytechnic State University, Odesa, Ukraine
ORCID: 0000-0002-8594-489X
E-mail: savhenko965@gmail.com

Alina O. Martyniuk
Odessa Polytechnic State University, Odesa, Ukraine
Email: alinanart2017@gmail.com

Dmitry O. Pulcha
Odessa Polytechnic State University, Odesa, Ukraine
Email: dima.pulcha@gmail.com

Received 02.12.2021

Recent public administration reforms in Ukraine, aimed at building a modern, digital and service-oriented state, place new demands on the civil servants’ professional and personal qualities, their level of professionalism and competence. The system of civil servants and local government officials’ training, retraining and advanced training is created to meet the needs of central and local executive bodies, local governments, other bodies and organizations covered by the Laws of Ukraine "On Civil Service" and "About Service in Local Self-Government Bodies" in highly professional and highly cultured employees, able to competently and responsibly perform management functions, implement the latest social technologies, promote innovation processes [1].

The issue of improving this system remains always open, as the management effectiveness in the country depends on the quality and professionalism of the human resources in the civil service, so the successful experience of civil servants’ training in other countries can serve as an excellent example for Ukraine.

Analysis of recent researches and publications

Many studies of domestic and foreign scientists are dedicated to the issue of civil servants’ training. Among domestic researchers who studied the civil servants’ training systems, it is necessary to single out O. Melnykov, N. Honcharuk, V. Hrynchenko, Ye. Borodin, L. Tytarenko, S. Kalashnikov. Among foreign scientists who studied the world experience of different countries it is worth to highlight N. Ilchenko, Zh. Talanova, T. Kitsak, Yu. Nechukhrana, N. Kalashnyk, O. Sliusarenko, M. Khim, Yu. Yashyn, V. Chmyha.

Unsolved aspects of the problem

In modern Ukraine, the civil service personnel are not properly trained to innovation activity and social
reforms implementation. To date, approaches to the civil servants’ professional training do not fully meet modern requirements and European standards.

The aim of the article is to analyze the successful experience of civil servants’ professional training in other countries, search and consideration of methods for their implementation in Ukraine.

The main part

Civil service is a public, professional, politically impartial activity for the practical implementation of a state’s tasks and functions, in particular regarding:
— analysis of the state policy at the national, sectoral and regional levels and proposals preparation for its formation, including the development and examination of draft programmes, concepts, strategies, draft laws and other regulations, draft international agreements;
— ensuring the state policy realization, implementation of national, sectoral and regional programmes, implementation of laws and other regulations;
— ensuring the affordable and quality administrative services provision;
— implementing the state supervision and control over compliance with the legislation;
— managing public financial resources, property and control over their use;
— state bodies personnel management;
— other powers implementation of the state bodies defined by the legislation.

A civil servant is a citizen of Ukraine who holds a civil service position in a public authority, another state body, its staff (secretariat) (hereinafter – a state body), receives a salary from the state budget and exercises the powers established for this position, directly related to the performing tasks and functions of such a state body, as well as adheres to the of civil service principles [2].

The system of civil servants’ training includes educational institutions that implement educational and professional training programmes, retraining and professional training programmes for civil servants and local government officials, training programmes in the field of training "Public Administration" and bodies managing training, retraining and advanced training of civil servants and local government officials.

Civil servants and local government officials’ training means acquiring educational and qualification level of a specialist or master, as well as implementing post-graduate training programme, doctoral studies, other educational institutions or research institutions in specialties aimed at professional activities in the civil service and local government municipality.

Civil servants and local government officials’ retraining is obtaining a specialty in the field of training "Public Administration" and in specialties aimed at carrying out professional activities in the civil service and in the local government service, based on previously acquired educational and qualification level and acquired practical experience.

Civil servants and local government officials’ advanced training is training to update and acquire competences, knowledge, skills and abilities in order to perform tasks and responsibilities necessary for professional activities in the civil service and in the local government bodies service [1].

The system of civil servants’ training can be successfully developed only with a constantly and qualitatively growing need for the consequences of their activities. It is necessary to create a new motivational mechanism, not just binding, but stimulating the civil servant to constantly update his/her professional skills and knowledge.

Applying successful foreign experience in the civil servants’ training is very useful for Ukraine, so, first of all, it is necessary to analyze the models of civil servants’ training organization of in different countries. Ukrainian researchers identify the following main of civil servants’ training models (Tab. 1).

Table 1 Consideration by Domestic Scientists of Models for Civil Servants’ Training Organization

| Author          | South-American (interdisciplinary approach; two-stage qualification system; dominance of university training type) | French (state-centralized system of training a small elite) | German (legal emphasis on the content of training programmes) | Anglo-Saxon (business approach in public administration) | Other |
|-----------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|
| N. Honcharuk    | +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |
| V. Hoshovska    | +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |
| V. Zolotarov    | +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |
| M. Yizia        | +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |
| M. Yizia        | +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |
| N. Kolisnichenko| +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |
| E. Hansova etc. | +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |
| N. Ilchenko     | +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |
| V. Luhtovyi     | +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |
| O. Melnykov     | +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |
| L. Tytarenko    | +                                                                                                   | +                                                           | +                                                              | +                                                         |       |

Source: compiled by authors on materials [3].
The Table 1 shows that most Ukrainian researchers claim that there are three main models of civil servants’ training. These are French, German and Anglo-Saxon, but it should be noted that M. Yizha draws attention to the fourth model, which is also no less important i.e. North American [4]. In turn, V. Luhowyi identifies two main models of civil servants’ training: North American (Canada, the USA) and Western European continental (the typical representatives are Spain, Italy, France) [5].

It is the French system of civil servants’ training adapted to the national civil service system that operates on the territory of Ukraine. This training system has been chosen because of the following advantages:

- It covers central national, designed for senior the civil service personnel training, regional and specialized sectoral educational institutions and ensures the acquisition by each civil servant of thorough knowledge in the field of public administration, high administrative and professional culture, competence, professionalism, ability to communicate effectively and professionally both within administration, citizens, public services consumers, which is extremely important in modern conditions.
- The system is complete and stable.
- Senior management positions can only be held by an employee who has the appropriate education.
- Changing political leaders automatically causes only senior officials to change. It promotes stability and ensures continuity in the professional civil servants’ activities [6].

The basis of the civil servants’ training system in France is a strong link between the state and civil servants. For France, this is a good answer to the basic questions of the civil service: how to make civil servants competent, loyal and selfless.

Competence is confirmed by a competitive exam before entering the civil service; their goals are not only to assess knowledge but also skills. Equal access to the civil service (a principle of the French constitution since the "Declaration of Human Rights" of 1789) is based on appropriate recruitment procedures, that include three objectives: to ensure fair selection procedures based on no conditions other than merit, future civil servants’ selection, based not only on the knowledge they have acquired, but also on their skills and abilities, organizing procedures in such a way that they do not have a deterrent effect on candidates.

As for training, it is considered a good, if not the best tool for human resource management. As civil servants are appointed on a long-term basis, long-term training strategies can be developed. Public expenditures on training in French public administration is higher than in the private sector.

Admission to primary education is through competitive exams. Training is aimed not only at providing knowledge but also skills. Therefore, training is divided into internships and study periods. Internships take place both in public administration (in France or abroad) and in the private sector. Their aim is to provide future civil servants with practical experience in specific administrative work improve their skills and introduce them to the basic management tools.

At the National School of Administration ENA (École Nationale d'Administration), for example, internships occupy a special place: almost two thirds of students’ school time is devoted to them. For all the students, either French or foreign, they mean performing duties, not simple observation. Students are considered civil servants with responsibilities and duties related to this status. They are responsible for a variety of tasks and must quickly gain the trust of the person responsible for the internship. Study periods are focused not on academic but on practical issues. Academic knowledge must be mastered by students and tested in competitive exams. Training is focused on the functioning of the administration, on public administration and, depending on the school, on technical subjects. The duration of primary education depends on the school. For example, 24 months in ENA, 1 year in institutions for regional administration (IRA).

In France, there are many institutions responsible for training: administrative schools, as a rule, organize primary education. Continuing education is organized by the administrations themselves (in the field of in-service training), the private sector, as well as administrative schools. However, administrative schools are the most effective educational institutions. In France, there is a huge network of such schools. They are closely linked to public administration bodies (at the state level, as well as at the level of local authorities and public hospitals), they can implement a training strategy for the population, taking into account the needs of the administration, as well as training objectives.

The basis of the North American model of the civil servants’ training is a systematic approach in assessing the level of candidates’ training for administrative positions. Representatives of this model are Canada and the USA, on the USA example; let's take a closer look at it.

The current civil service in the USA is based on a "merit system", which means recruiting qualified people, preferably from different backgrounds. Civil servants’ professional training in the USA takes place in three main areas: at the level of higher education institutions, specialized institutions for training and private initiatives for the civil servants’ professional training. The large number of institutions that specialize in the civil servants’ professional training in each state and at the federal level has become the result of a balanced policy of the administration to ensure multi-vector training in management in the US government institutions.

The following are the basic levels of the civil servants’ training in the USA (Fig. 1).
Bachelor's degree is usually a minimum requirement for a career in public administration. In fact, the Bureau of Labour Statistics (BLS) notes it as a typical requirement for administrative service managers. However, your degree does not have to be in public administration, political science, or a related field of specialization. Years of civil service experience can replace training.

Practical experience, from undergraduate internships to early professional experience, is very valuable. An internship can lead to a full-time job after graduation. Participating in the life of society through volunteering and other ways also creates relationships that can be valuable for advancing your career as a public administrator.

Advanced positions may require either State degree or Master's degree. Online Master of Public Administration (MPA) programmes allow working professionals to continue their education. This degree can help to develop leadership and management skills, as well as data analysis and policy skills for planning and managing complex societal issues. The degree is designed for students who will be able to work in the relevant positions of the executive branch of government at the local, regional and federal levels, as well as in non-governmental organizations and the non-profit sector. The main programme directions concern the role, public administration principles, public policy implementation, relations between institutions of executive and legislative branches, procedures for budget formation and financial management, personnel management in the public sector, etc.

The leading universities for training Masters in public administration are Maxwell University in Syracuse, Jh. Kennedy Harvard School, Indiana University, Wooden Wilson Princeton School of International Relations, Georgia State University, University of California (Berkeley), University of Kansas, Gerald R. Ford School of Public Policy, University of Southern California, etc. [7].

The activity of the network of specialized institutions for organizing the civil servants' professional training is coordinated by the Bureau of Personnel Management, which is designed to provide effective training of professional managers of the US government agencies.

The main partners in this area are the Federal Executive Institute and the Graduate School. The target group for the programmes of the Federal Executive Institute are civil servants of middle and senior management levels.

Training aimed at improving managerial skills, developing civil servants’ leadership qualities in the public sector, as well as training on constructive conflict resolution are held in the Eastern and Western centres for management development.

Postgraduate School works with a wider audience and offers training courses for the civil servants of various levels and orientations. Topics of full-time and distance learning curricula include certified courses in accounting, auditing, contracting, tax policy basics. More general courses cover personnel management, the basics of advocacy, project management, programme and management analysis, entrepreneurship basics, environmental training programmes, and administrative procedures.

In addition to specialized institutions for civil servants' advanced training, there is a number of non-governmental organizations and private trainers in the United States who work on the similar training programmes development and provide consulting services in the field of public administration. One of the most famous institutions of this type is the National Academy of Public Administration. Created with the support of the US Congress, the National Academy focuses on programme preparation, research on public administration and management, and public-private partnerships [7].

Great Britain is the founder of the Anglo-Saxon model. It is based on the managerial team professional development, which is carried out mainly in the workplace through the mentoring system development and through the using distance learning. Such a programme is not additional, but, on the contrary, is implemented as a strategy for employees’ professional development and is designed, as a rule, 3-5 years.

Figure 1. Levels of Civil Servants’ Training in the USA

Source: authors’ own development
Responsibility for the civil servants’ professional training system in the United Kingdom is entrusted to the Civil Service Commission and the Council for the Training and Capacity Building of the Civil Service. The main central educational institution is the National School of Government.

The main training programmes of the National Government School are:
- open courses (32 curricula are built on the competence approach);
- programmes for leaders (courses aimed at developing leadership competencies, special programmes for ministerial officials);
- "custom" programmes;
- accredited professional programmes that are developed and taught jointly with other educational institutions (specialties “risk management”, “audit”, “international consulting”, “HRM manager” and many others).
- Upon the programme completion, the student receives a diploma or certificate.

The whole system of recruitment, training and promotion in Great Britain is organized in such a way as to create a type of professional manager, a broad-based administrator. Political heads of ministries always value such professional leaders (generalists – in British terminology). It is known that only a small number of ministers are administration specialists in their field of activity; they need consultants, i.e. officials who can transform the experts’ opinions into proposals and projects that are clear to a minister. Another important argument in favour of generalists in the public administration office is that the significant use of general administrators simplifies the overall coordination of management. In addition, experts are not able to analyze emerging problems in the broad context of general public administration tasks. D. Steele draws special attention to the fact that generalists can generalize the experience of the entire state mechanism only by ceasing to perform expert functions in specific activity areas.

However, in recent decades, Great Britain has become increasingly supportive of the growing role of specialists in public administration, which focuses on the American model. Proponents of the administrators’ specialization believe that the modern system of public administration is so complicated that generalists are not able to cope with the increased volume of tasks, so experts spend a lot of time to present the problem to them in a simple and accessible form. Another experts’ argument is that too much emphasis is placed on improving the entire management system as a whole to the detriment of specific areas and objectives. As a result, the efficiency of the entire public administration system is reduced.

The German model of organizing the civil servants’ training is based on the legal emphasis on the content of training programmes. The German civil service is divided by qualification levels and types of work. An employee may be hired as a civil servant with an individual contract, or as a civil servant with a service lifetime, including special rights and responsibilities. Both forms of employment exist at each qualification level. The Civil service in Germany is divided into three qualification levels: the intermediate civil service, the middle civil service and the higher civil service. The senior civil servants take on managerial tasks; the middle level civil servants evaluate and make decisions at the operational level, while the intermediate level civil servants carry out operations.

At the federal level, federal employees’ advanced training is entrusted to the Federal Academy of Public Administration under the Federal Ministry of the Internal Affairs, which has six campuses. Employees are selected for training by the decision of local institutions, taking into account which programme requires advanced training. If the applicant meets the previous requirements of the programme (target group, position group, functional responsibilities and has the appropriate prior knowledge for training in the programme), he/she will be able to participate in the programme. All courses at the Academy are built according to the authorities’ needs, and the number of places in the courses is determined by the applications of institutions. If the demand is higher than the possible number of places to study for a particular programme, then additional courses are organized (if resources are available) to meet the demand. The Academy informs higher education institutions in advance about how many places it can provide for certain courses.

The structure of the Federal Academy is divided into five main divisions (Lehrgruppen):
- LG 1: general issues and coordination;
- LG 2: general professional development and training for the highest group of positions;
- LG 3: training on the EU issues and international competences;
- LG 4: training in behaviour formation, human resources management, supervisory officials’ training
- LG 5: IT training and distance learning.

In cooperation with the Ministry and other authorities, the institution develops and implements special educational programmes for the federal government personnel training for state programmes implementation.

The main trends observed in the activity of the academy are strengthening the international, European dimension; focus on a leadership approach to public administration; distance / e-learning development.

The Federal Academy offers (planned for a year) a large number of courses focused on the needs of federal government agencies. What exactly one needs to choose from the proposed for further professional growth, decides the candidate for training together with the management of the institution where he/she works.

The courses are short-term: three-day, weekly, two-week (the list of course titles comprises 37 pages). The courses are taught by full-time teachers and guest practitioners. The list of courses is updated every 5 years.

A number of courses is offered for career growth, which are divided into the following:
basic courses for career growth (lasting 10 weeks, accomplished by a written exam covering the issues of state and constitutional law, the EU law, general legal acts in the field of administration, legal acts governing EU administration, economic management, legal acts of the public service, management competences; additional courses to deepen knowledge and increase the professional level in the current position (lasts 2 weeks, are mandatory and are a preparation for certification); special courses (offered at choice, related to the activity area).

Training is provided for different levels. For example, training for higher service takes the form of an internship (Referendariat), a two-year preparatory service. The total learning time for this period is at least 6 months (basic and additional courses). The standard set of courses of the Federal Academy is designed for 4 months of training as an intern. The rest of the learning time is devoted to the studying special elective courses. For a trainee, the institution where he/she undergoes advanced training develops a special curriculum in accordance with the profile of the positions group, where the necessary and selected courses are entered. The curriculum serves as a document provided to the Federal Personnel Commission for appointment after two years of preparatory service [7, 8].

All the above models of civil servants’ training have their advantages that can be implemented in Ukraine (table 2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Models of civil servants’ training organization</th>
<th>Foreign experience that can be implemented in Ukraine</th>
<th>Methods of their implementation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>French</td>
<td>Administrative schools and internships</td>
<td>The network of such schools development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North-American</td>
<td>Postgraduate school</td>
<td>Establishment of specialized institutions and academies for civil servants’ advanced training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglo-Saxon</td>
<td>A strategic training system that creates the type of professional leader, a broad profile administrator</td>
<td>Review of civil servants’ professional training programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>Legal emphasis on the training programmes content. A number of special courses</td>
<td>Construction of a special academy according to the authorities’ needs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: authors’ own development

Considering the French model of the civil servants’ training organization it is possible to allocate the efficiency of administrative schools and training system. And although the Ukrainian model is adapted to the French one, these elements of training have not been included for various reasons. But the civil service and the training system are evolving and have the opportunity to introduce new tools for their development and civil servants’ development. Therefore, developing a network of administrative schools and ensuring their close connection with the public administration of Ukraine will allow civil servants to develop in the direction that will be needed primarily by the state, local self-government bodies etc. About internship it is possible to note that in France it is given two thirds of educational time. Ukrainian civil servants lack experience and skills even after completing higher education, as very little time is allocated to internships and practical training period. There is also a lack of internships and there is no established system for their provision and distribution among students.

The North-American model is known for the level of postgraduate school development. The creation of specialized institutions and academies for the civil servants’ advanced training in Ukraine will ensure the availability of training courses of various levels and directions, which will allow employees in this field to develop in the direction of interest to them. The right of choice will motivate and interest a larger audience in the future, which will lead to the absence of a permanent shortage of staff. It will be necessary to ensure that such courses are certified and implemented both in person and remotely.

The Anglo-Saxon model is based on a strategic system of education, which creates a type of professional leader, a broad profile administrator, which is a very interesting experience for our state. The civil servants’ training in Ukraine is mostly specialized, which means that specialists are not able to analyze the problems that arise in a wide range. Therefore, it makes sense to review Ukrainian training programmes for the civil servants and amend them.

In the German model of the civil servants’ training organization, Ukraine can borrow viewpoints on the training system, taking into account the content of training programmes with a legal emphasis and a number of special courses. Designing a special academy in accordance with the authorities’ needs will allow to quickly adapt to external changes and train qualified specialists. It will support all current trends and focus on the European dimension by implementing special training programmes for civil servants.

Conclusions

Thus, the civil servants’ training in Ukraine is not perfectly developed and requires foreign experience
involvement to improve the efficiency of the training, retraining and advanced training system. It is adapted to the French system of the civil servants’ training and was chosen because of various advantages, but after years of its application there is a need to reconsider approaches to training, as only a system that develops and introduces new methods of training is effective. In our opinion, Ukraine can borrow experience in four models of civil servants’ training: French, North American, Anglo-Saxon and German. The French model, despite the fact that the Ukrainian system is adapted to it, can share the experience of implementing administrative schools and a successful internship system. In the North American model, there are postgraduate schools that have not yet been implemented in Ukraine. The establishment of specialized institutions for the civil servants’ advanced training in Ukraine, which will provide various courses for employee development, will be a significant motivator for them to advance in their careers. Also, the strategic training system on the example of the Anglo-Saxon model will raise the level of employees’ qualification, as it creates professional administrators of a broad profile. In turn, the German model of organizing civil servants’ training can lend its experience to Ukrainians with a bias towards a legal emphasis and a focus on European views. All these methods of implementing foreign experience will allow the Ukrainian civil servants to support global trends and adjust training programmes for civil servants in the context of the country’s needs.

Abstract

The article is dedicated to considering professionalization as one of the ways to implement the theory leadership in public administration. The main idea of the article is that without the formation and selection of a professional team of managers, any leader will not be able to qualitatively and fully perform public administration functions. Therefore, it is important to shape professional teams, as the experience of Ukraine has shown that there is no professional training for the civil servants and employees of local self-government bodies can cause sabotage in the performance of professional activities and nullify any good ideas and mechanisms for implementing the strategic vision of the country, city or industry. Emphasis is also placed on the considering professionalization for employees of local self-government bodies, as the heads of these bodies are elected directly by the territorial community and directly close to it.

Thus, the study implementation methods of foreign experience in civil servants’ professional training has shown that the civil servants’ training in Ukraine has many areas for further development, it should strengthen the level of professionalism of public officials and provide them with competent staff. The developed implementation methods of perspective elements of four models for civil servants training (French, North American, Anglo-Saxon and German) in Ukraine aim to improve the Ukrainian system of civil servants’ training, retraining and advanced training and change their views based on current trends.

Thus, the civil servants’ training in Ukraine is not perfectly developed and requires the involvement of foreign experience to improve the efficiency of the system of training, retraining and advanced training. It is adapted to the French system of training civil servants and was chosen because of various advantages, but after years of its use there is a need to reconsider approaches to training, as only a system that develops and introduces new methods of training is effective. In our opinion, Ukraine can borrow experience in four models of organizing the training of civil servants: French, North American, Anglo-Saxon and German. The French model, despite the fact that the Ukrainian system is adapted to it, can share the experience of implementing administrative schools and a successful internship system. In the North American model, there are postgraduate schools that have not yet been implemented in Ukraine.

Establishing specialized institutions for civil servants’ advanced training in Ukraine, which will provide various courses for the employee’s development, will be a significant motivator for them to advance in their careers. Also, the strategic training system on the example of the Anglo-Saxon model will raise the level of employees’ qualification, as it creates professional administrators of a broad profile. In turn, the German model of organizing the civil servants’ training can lend its experience to Ukrainians with a bias towards a legal emphasis and a focus on European views. All these methods of implementing foreign experience satisfy the Ukrainian civil servants to support global trends and adjust training programmes for civil servants in the context of the country’s needs.

Список літератури:

4. Іжа М.М. Сучасні аспекти професіоналізації державної служби в Україні: монографія / М. М. Іжа, С. А. Попов, Т. І. Пахомова [та ін.]; заг. ред. М. М. Іжа. – Національна академія держ.

References:

Посилання на статтю:

Reference a Journal Article:

This is an open access journal and all published articles are licensed under a Creative Commons “Attribution” 4.0.